OCR H573 | INDEPENDENT REVISION

A* Model Essay

Ancient Influences

Philosophy of Religion

Is Aristotle's account of reality more convincing than Plato's?

1,480 response words | Complete annotated PDF | Individual topic edition

What is included

A complete original response, an argument plan, paragraph-level AO1/AO2 annotations and source works for further reading.

A* describes the intended style of this teaching model. This is independently written, not an OCR-marked script or a guaranteed grade.

Use this model to study argument and evaluation, then write your own answer. Do not submit it as your own assessed work.

Individual-use digital edition | 10 November 2026

Argument plan

Is Aristotle's account of reality more convincing than Plato's?

Thesis: Aristotle offers the more convincing starting point because form explains the observable organisation and activity of particular things without requiring a separate realm. However, this comparative advantage does not establish that every natural process has an intrinsic purpose or that cosmic change requires his Prime Mover. Plato remains stronger as a challenge to the sufficiency of appearances than as a demonstrated account of a second realm.

1. Plato rightly distinguishes appearances from rational standards of judgement.

Counter-argument: The distinction does not demonstrate separately existing Forms or explain participation.

Interim judgement: Plato identifies an epistemic need more successfully than he establishes its proposed ontology.

2. Aristotle explains individual substances through matter, form and four causes.

Counter-argument: The success of material and efficient explanation does not automatically validate natural final causes.

Interim judgement: Immanent form is comparatively economical, while final causation needs case-specific defence.

3. The Prime Mover connects cosmic intelligibility with a necessary final cause.

Counter-argument: An unmoved object of desire neither straightforwardly creates nor personally sustains the world.

Interim judgement: Aristotle's local explanations are stronger than his ultimate cosmological conclusion.