OCR H573 | INDEPENDENT REVISION

A* Model Essay

Christian Moral Action

Christian Thought

Does Bonhoeffer give Christians a convincing basis for resisting an unjust state?

1,583 response words | Complete annotated PDF | Individual topic edition

What is included

A complete original response, an argument plan, paragraph-level AO1/AO2 annotations and source works for further reading.

A* describes the intended style of this teaching model. This is independently written, not an OCR-marked script or a guaranteed grade.

Use this model to study argument and evaluation, then write your own answer. Do not submit it as your own assessed work.

Individual-use digital edition | 10 November 2026

Argument plan

Does Bonhoeffer give Christians a convincing basis for resisting an unjust state?

Thesis: Bonhoeffer gives a compelling basis for Christian resistance by making discipleship responsible for victims rather than obedient to institutional self-preservation. His account is strongest as a demanding framework of accountability and weakest if exceptional responsibility is converted into a general permission for religiously justified violence.

1. Costly grace demands concrete discipleship rather than passive religious belonging.

Counter-argument: Costliness alone cannot establish that a proposed action is right.

Interim judgement: The concept supplies commitment, while Christ and responsibility to others must supply moral direction.

2. The Church may question the state, assist victims and resist destructive power.

Counter-argument: Intervention risks clerical domination and reckless self-certainty.

Interim judgement: Resistance is strongest when directed to the protection of victims and subject to public moral scrutiny.

3. Responsible action can require accepting guilt under tragic conditions.

Counter-argument: This may conflict with Jesus's nonviolence or excuse almost any emergency measure.

Interim judgement: It explains moral tragedy without turning assassination into a universal Christian rule.